

NIST BOULDER EDITORIAL REVIEW BOARD
Manuscript Review Form

Form BL-7A
(Rev. 1/89)

Section I: To be completed by author

A. Manuscript Title: **Quantum Randomness from Probability Estimation with Classical Side Info:**

B. Principal NIST Author: **E. Knill**

Ext.: **6263**

Co-authors: **Y. Zhang, P. Bierhorst, S. Glancy**

C. Intended Publication Medium: **QCRYPT17**

D. **AUTHOR!** Please respond to questions below by checking the appropriate boxes.
Explain any "NO" answers and give appropriate manuscript page numbers.

	Does Not Apply	
Yes	No	

- | | | | |
|----|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| 1. | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Is manuscript free from trade names (product, company, process)? |
| 2. | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> Are SI units used throughout? |
| 3. | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> When numbers are reported, are accuracy/precision statements made? |
| 4. | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Is intended medium published in United States? |
| 5. | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> If non-NIST publication, does manuscript show copyright disclaimer? |
| 6. | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Is this the first publication of this manuscript? |
| 7. | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Is copyrighted material used by permission and acknowledged? |

SECTION II: To be completed by reviewer

TO THE REVIEWER: To promote effective and accurate scientific communication, please review the accompanying manuscript carefully. The following checklist may assist your evaluation. Give further comments in the space below. Please comment especially on needs for improvement.

	Good	Adequate	Needs Improvement
1. Technical soundness and reliability	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Organization	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Writing quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Title (clear, concise, complete)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5. Abstract (adequate, informative) N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6. Results (clear)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7. Discussion (relevant)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8. Conclusions (clear)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
9. References (necessary and sufficient)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
10. Figures and tables (adequate, acceptable quality)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Which aspects of the manuscript lie outside your area of expertise?

I'm a theoretician, while the abstract addresses applications to experiments.

Low High
0 1 2 3 4 5

Rating of your familiarity with the subject 5
 Overall rating of technical content 5
 Overall rating of manuscript preparation 5

Further comments: (Check here if you attach additional sheets.)

Pages 1-2 are very clear - I didn't follow all of page 3, but given space constraints I think it's a good abstract.

Some phrases / notation that could be clarified:

- Pp. 1 (bottom): "In the above analysis we assume" - meaning ref. [8]?
- Pp. 2: " T_i is measurable with respect to $R_{\leq i}$ "
- Pp. 3: The notation " \mathbb{P}^B "

Reviewer's name and affiliation (NIST Div. #): Carl Miller, 773 Telephone: 301-975-5306
(print or type)

email address: carl.miller@nist.gov Date: 4/21/17

Recommendation:
 Publish as is Publish with optional revisions
 Publish with mandatory revisions Do not publish